

PARSHA FROM THE SOURCE

פרשה ממקורה

12 Tamuz 5786

פרשת חקת-בלק תשפ"ו

What was the sin that Moshe committed when he hit the rock?

Rashi Bamidbar 20:11

France, 11th c.

"[He struck the rock] twice." Because at first, it brought out only drops, since the Omnipresent (God) had not commanded him to strike it, but rather: "And you shall speak to the rock." However, they had spoken to a different rock and it did not bring forth [water]. They said, "Perhaps it needs to be struck as it was the first time," as it is said: "And you shall strike the rock" (Exodus 17:6). Then that rock happened to be before them, and he struck it. (From The Tanchuma)

רש"י במדבר כ:יא

רבי שלמה יצחקי

פעמים. לפי שבראשונה לא הוציא אלא טפין, לפי שלא צוה המקום להכותו, אלא "ודברתם אל הסלע", והמה דברו אל סלע אחר ולא הוציא, אמרו, שמא צריך להכותו כבראשונה, שנאמר "והכית בצור" (שמות י"ז), ונזדמן להם אותו סלע והכהו (תנחומא):

Rashi quotes from the Medrash Tanchuma that Moshe's sin was that he was supposed to talk to the rock and he hit it instead.

Rambam's Shmoneh Perakim, End Chap. 4

Spain, 12th c.

"And you know that the master of the first and the last, Moshe our teacher, peace be upon him, was already addressed by Hashem (who should be blessed), who said to him: 'Because you did not believe in Me, to sanctify Me in the eyes of the children of Israel' (Numbers 20:12); 'Because you rebelled against My commandment at the waters of Meribah' (Numbers 20:24); 'Because you did not sanctify Me in the midst of the children of Israel' (Deuteronomy 32:51). And his sin, peace be upon him, was this: he inclined toward one of the extremes regarding a moral virtue—namely, patience—when he inclined toward the side of anger, by saying: 'Hear now, you rebels!' (Numbers 20:10). Hashem scrutinized him strictly for this: that a man like him should become angry before the congregation of Israel in a situation where anger was unwarranted. In the case of a person like him, such an act is a desecration of God's Name (Chilul Hashem). This is because people learn from all of his movements and all of his words, hoping to attain through them success in this world and the World to Come. How, then, could anger be seen in him—which is an evil action, as we have explained, and arises only from a negative trait among the traits of the soul?"

רמב"ם שמונה פרקים,

סוף פרק ד

רב משה בן מיימון

ואתה יודע שאדון הראשונים והאחרונים: משה רבנו, ע"ה, כבר אמר אליו השם יתברך: "יען לא האמנת בי להקדישני לעיני בני ישראל" (במדבר כ, יב). "על אשר מריתם את פי למי מריבה" (שם כד). "על אשר לא קדשתם אותי בתוך בני ישראל" (דברים לב, נא). וחטאו, ע"ה, הוא: שנטה לצד אחד מן הקצוות ממעלת המידות, והיא: הסבלנות. כאשר נטה לצד הרגזנות באמרו: "שמעו נא המורים" (במדבר כ, י), דקדק עליו השם יתברך: שיהיה אדם כמוהו כועס לפני עדת ישראל במקום שאין ראוי בו הכעס. וכיוצא בזה בדין האיש ההוא - חילול השם הוא. מפני שמתנועותיו ומדבריו כולם למדים, והיו מקוים להגיע בהם אל הצלחת העולם הזה והעולם הבא - ואיך יראה בו הכעס, והוא מפעולות הרע, כמו שבארנו, ולא יבוא כי אם מתכונות רעות מתכונות הנפש.

The Rambam takes a different approach than Rashi.
He thinks that Moshe's sin was the fact that he got angry.

Ohr HaChaim Hakadosh, 20:8

Morocco, 17th c.

This Torah portion has been heavily debated by all the commentators of the Torah, and I have searched through it to illuminate it with the light of life (or b'or hachaim). Before we examine the plain meaning of the verses, we must first understand what Moshe's inadvertent error was in this matter, which caused his decree. I have seen ten different approaches stated regarding this matter in the words of the Torah commentators, and here they are in brief.

7) Rabbeinu Chananel—with whom the Ramban (Nachmanides) agreed—[explains] that Hashem's 'resentment' was because Moshe said, 'Shall we bring forth water for you?' instead of saying, 'Shall He bring forth for you.' Because of this, the Jewish people erred and thought that they were performing the deed through their own wisdom, as there was no explicit indication that Hashem was the One performing the miracle. It was for this reason that Hashem 'resented' it and said, 'Because you did not believe in Me, to sanctify Me...'

אור החיים הקדוש כ:ח

ר' חיים בן עטר

פרשה זו רבו עליה כל מפרשי התורה, ותרתיה בה לאור באור החיים. וקודם שנעמוד על פשטן של כתובים נקדים להבין מה היתה שגגתו של משה בענין זה אשר היה סבה לגזרתו, וראיתי שנאמרו עשרה דרכים בענין בדברי מפרשי התורה והן הנה בקצרה...
(ז') רבינו חננאל, והסכים אליו רמב"ן, שהקפדת ה' היתה על אשר אמר "נוציא לכם מים" ולא אמר "ווציא לכם", שמזה טעו ישראל וחשבו כי הם בחכמתם עושים את המעשה, כי לא היה להם רמז כי ה' הוא העושה הנס, ולזה הקפיד ה' ואמר "לא האמנתם בי להקדישני" וגו'.

The Ohr HaChaim quotes the answer of Rabbeinu Chananel and the Ramban that Moshe's sin was not publicly acknowledging it was from Hashem.

Questions for Reflection:

1. Are these answers mutually exclusive?
2. Why was the punishment for Moshe, for what seems to be relatively minor, so harsh?

פרשה ממקורה is generously sponsored by the members of KJBS

Shabbat Afternoon
SHIURIM
with **NILI**
WWW.NILITORAH.ORG

Parshat Chukat-Balak
June 27

LINCOLNWOOD 5:30 PM
MRS. SHERRY FRIEDMAN
hosted by:
RAYLI BLUMBERG
6508 N KIMBALL AVE.

SKOKIE 5:30 PM
MS. KATE KRAMER
hosted by:
TAMI MILLER
9129 KEELER AVE.

WEST ROGERS PARK 5:30 PM
RABBI YITZY WEISS
hosted by:
CHERYL KARP
2810 W. GREENLEAF
INFO@NILITORAH.ORG

This shiur is sponsored
IN LOVING MEMORY OF
דוד בן אליהו משה זצ"ל
DON KIRSHNER
ON THE OCCASION OF HIS 10TH
YAHRTZEIT ON תמוז ה'תשס"א
by the
THE KIRSHNER FAMILY

FOR CAMP CHAI CAMPERS
SUNDAY MORNING
FAMILY LEARNING

with the **תורה נציון KOLLEL** in partnership with **CAMP CHAI**

For campers going into 4th - 6th grades with family members!

Boys, bring your dads, uncles or grandfathers!
Girls, bring your moms, aunts or grandmothers!

BOYS SESSIONS
9AM Davening | 9:30-10:15AM Breakfast, Learning, & Raffle
June 28 at Or Torah | July 5 at Yeshurun

GIRLS SESSIONS
9:30-10:15AM Breakfast, Learning, & Raffle
July 12 at Or Torah | July 19 at JCC

773.973.6557 | INFO@TORAHCHICAGO.ORG | WWW.TORAHCHICAGO.ORG